

Setti D. Warren Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: November 25, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: **David Morton, Chairman**

Peter Dimond, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate Katy Hax Holmes, Staff

Mark Armstrong, Member Jeff Templer, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member See Attendance List

ABSENT: Len Sherman, Alternate

Jean Fulkerson, Member

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Chairman. Voting permanent members were Morton, Grissom, Armstrong, Dimond, Fitzmaurice, and Templer. Klapper was assigned to vote. Katy Hax Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device.

1058 Beacon Street - Landmark Study Request

Request to remove portion of front, side and rear of house, demolish garage

Lawrence Lee, representing the owner of this property, Ward Shifman, spoke on his behalf. Mr. Shifman was not present. Mr. Lee stated the owner's objection to the study report and ultimately the potential landmarking of the property. He also told the assembled that at this time Mr. Shifman had no development plans for this parcel. Several abutters attended in support of the NHC approving the study report for potentially landmarking this property. They were: Mary McCully, 46 Pine Crest Road; 30 Pine Crest Road; 940 Walnut Street; 52 Pine Crest Road; 12 Pine Crest Road; 1062 Beacon Street; 36 Pine Crest Road; 58 Pine Crest Road; 923 Walnut Street; 45 Pine Crest Road, and 57 Pine Crest Road. The NHC Chairman asked for a hands-vote to see how many in the audience supported approval of the study report on this property. Twenty-four hands were raised in support. Alderman Danberg also spoke in support of the study report.

Staff reported that this property consists of a circa 1868 worker cottage believed to have been moved back from Beacon Street to its current location in the 1890s, as well as a circa 1890 barn. The property was owned by William Connell, an Irish laborer who resided here through the early 20th-century. The immediate vicinity consisted of the Whole Foods as



well as 19th-century residences along Beacon Street with some early 20th-century buildings on Pine Crest Road. Of the two buildings, the residence has had more substantial alterations including vinyl siding, replacement windows, and a new porch. The residence does however retain two pedimented dormers, which suggest Greek-Revival style. The barn to the rear of the property has replacement windows, but is largely intact.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to support the preparation of a study report and start the process to qualify the property at 1058 Beacon Street as individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places and thus a candidate for designation as a local landmark by the NHC. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to support the preparation of a study report and start the process to qualify the property at 1058 Beacon Street as individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places and thus a candidate for designation as a local landmark by the NHC.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Dave Morton, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

7 Norman Road - Preservation Restriction

Joe Cornish, an attorney for Historic New England, said he worked with the owner, Diana Korsnick, to develop a preservation restriction that would run with the property in perpetuity for saving architectural features on both the interior and exterior of the house, as identified by the current owner. Mr. Cornish said this was the first Shingle Style house to be accepted by the non-profit. Ms. Korsnick presented her reasons for saving the house. Abutters at 36 Pine Crest and 58 Pine Crest stated their support for approving the preservation restriction on this property.

Staff reported that the owner of this property had been working with Brian Lever to preserve both the interior and exterior of her home for at least a year. In order to donate an historic easement and restriction on the historic materials and appearance of her house, the owner drew up a legal agreement which must be approved by the Newton Historical Commission. The house is known as

RESOLVED to recommend to the Board of Alderman that a preservation restriction be granted on this house. the Peabody-Williams House, built in 1891 and designed by J. Williams Beal. Interior architectural detailing of the house was designed by Andrew Lees, and his daughter lived in the house from the early 1900s to the 1950s. The house was individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1986. Interior and exterior architectural details and extensively documented in this easement proposal. Staff recommended that the NHC approve a preservation restriction on this property.

Grissom made a motion to recommend to the Board of Alderman that a preservation restriction be granted on this house. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

Abstained

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative

Dave Morton, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

74 Ruane Road

Ron Gold, of Gold Associates in Boston, presented his plan to demolish the house because it had no desirable architectural integrity. He said he wants to build a house of the same length and add another half story or so. Two abutters in the audience asked about a tree and the possible replacement structure.

Staff reported that a 1953 building permit for this house was filed with the Inspectional Services Department by Ely Lehman, owner. By 1961, Robert Boyer and family (CPA) owned the house. In 1974, still owned by Robert Boyer, this Ranch Style house had an addition constructed on the master bedroom and extra closet space. The Boyers still owned the house in 1985. This Ranch Style house, though with a rear addition, was built at the same time as other homes on the street and retains neighborhood massing, scale, orientation, and horizontality. There has been some tear-down activity in the neighborhood, though not as much here as in others in the vicinity. Staff recommended this house preferably preserved for historic context.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 74 Ruane Road preferably preserved for historic context. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to find the house at 74 Ruane Road preferably preserved for historic context. .

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

962 Walnut Street

No owner was present for this property. This house was proposed for full demolition. An abutter at 30 Pine Crest Road spoke in favor of keeping houses such as this, which were now so rare. Ariella Stober at 58 Pine Crest Road spoke in favor of saving the house. Isabel Albeck of 240 Windsor also spoke in favor of keeping the house. So did 24 Pine Crest and 12 Pine Crest Road, 941 Walnut Street, and 39 Pine Crest Road.

Staff reported that the house was built c.1885, and that this worker cottage located with others on Walnut Street was built in the Italianate Style. Though Shingle Style and later 19th and early 20th century additions have been constructed, the house has a central chimney which had led some to believe the house was built even earlier. This intersection of Walnut and Beacon was dotted with worker housing owned predominantly by Irish immigrants in the late 19th century. On land originally owned by William Connell, who resided at 1058 Beacon Street presented earlier, this house was owned c.1885 by John Kelly, a laborer. He first appears in the 1885 directory as living in a house on 'Beacon near Walnut.' The 1886 atlas, however, shows no house at this location but one likely appears not long after the map was produced. The house does appear under Kelly's ownership on the 1895 map. This three-bay by one-bay house with a central pavilion shows evidence of historic adaptations to a worker cottage over time and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and for context with the remaining Irish worker cottages found on Walnut and Beacon Streets.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 962 Walnut Street preferably preserved for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman Nancy Grissom, Member Jeff Templer, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

259 Cherry Street

No owners were present. One attendee at the hearing encouraged the commission to save the structure, as the street was very architecturally consistent.

Staff reported that this late 19th century worker cottage was built on a section of Cherry Street where this style of house is ubiquitous. Michael Glynn, laborer, first appears in directories in 1881 as living at this location, and continues to live at this address until the late 1920s. The ownership of the house alternated between the Glynns and William Meehan before 1928. Meehan may have boarded and then later owned the house, but in either case he is listed as owner from at least 1928 through the 1960s, approximately 40 years. Margaret Meehan owned the house in 1963. By 1973, J.P. McHugh owned the house, a retiree. Yet another example of a workers' cottage, this time in West Newton, this simple two-bay by one-bay house on a cut stone foundation is very similar to others located on Cherry Street both in form, style, and in origin. Therefore staff recommended this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Dimond made a motion to find the property preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the property at 259 Cherry Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman Nancy Grissom, Member Jeff Templer, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

28 Jameson Road

Peter and Margot Shields, owners of this house, presented their plan to demolish the house they have lived in for almost 30 years, and build a new one on the same lot. They speculated as to whether they would keep the garage.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1924 by the Newton Real Estate Trust and designed by R. Gammons, and the permit is on file with ISD. In 1926, Gordon Russell first appears as owner when he pulled a permit for a wood, 2-car garage. In 1961, Gordon was still the owner when he obtained a permit to enclose the existing porch. In 1987, a rear addition was constructed when the house was owned by Peter Shields. Occupations were not listed in the directory for either owner. This 1920s, center-entrance Colonial Style house is one of many on this street, and retains its original location, scale, massing, and architectural detail. For this reason staff recommended this house preferably preserved for historic context.

A Commission member asked why after thirty years the owners thought the current house was 'unlivable.' Mr. Shields responded that the ceilings were low and there was no closet space. The possibility of additions was discussed, but the owners said the house was not conducive to additions. A Commission member said he had a hard time imposing conditions on long-term owners of houses. Other members thought this was a quintessential 1920s house in good condition, and still others offered that there had been some tear-down activity in the neighborhood.

Grissom made a motion to find this house preferably preserved for historic context and architectural integrity. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-3:

RESOLVED to find the house at 28 Jameson Road preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman Nancy Grissom, Member

> Jeff Templer, Member Mark Armstrong, Member

Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

1004 Centre Street

Jim Corsi, owner of this property, told the Commission he grew up in Newton and now wanted to buy this house to work on with his brother and father. The previous owners were in their 90s, he said, and there was a lot of work to be done. The rear of the house had a few additions, the garage was falling apart, and there had been a fire in the rear of the house. He told the Commission he wanted to keep the house and add to it, and demolish the existing garage.

Though the agenda for this property showed that it was listed on the NR, it is actually not (typo). The staff report presented at the hearing was accurate, however.

This brick, Colonial Revival Style house was built in 1920 by its first owner, George R. and Theresa J. McLean, a treasurer in South Boston, and designed by H.M. Ramsay, a Boston architect. The building permit for this house, and a separate permit for a garage from the same year, is on file with ISD. Both buildings were designed by Ramsay. Fifty-seven houses designed by Ramsay have been surveyed and included on the MACRIS database; of these, six are listed on the State Register of Historic Places. His career spanned the Colonial Revival era from the first decade of the 20th century to the 1950s, when he designed Ranch Style homes in Newton.

Though many stately historic homes on this street have been previously surveyed by an architectural historian, this one was not. In 1936, the McLeans obtained a permit for 'rooms and piazza additions to first and second floors rear of house.' The McLeans continued to own the house into the 1970s, a total of over 50 years in this house. By 1974 the

house was owned by Dr. Steven Anapolle, who hired architect William Tuccero to remodel the kitchen. In 2014 a building permit was filed for interior demo due to fire damage. Though Ramsay was a well-known architect and was responsible for many high-style homes in Newton and Boston, this house underwent numerous additions over the years and was recently damaged by fire. Staff believed that the combined effect of these alterations compromised the historical significance of this house and the garage. Staff recommended neither the house nor the garage preferably preserved.

Templer made a motion to find the garage not preferably preserved. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-1:

Mark Armstrong, Member

Abstained

RESOLVED to find the garage at 1004 Centre Street not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative

Dave Morton, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Templer made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 1004 Centre Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

At the hearing, proposed plans for a partial rear addition were presented and suggestions made to improve them. Details that Mr. Corsi said would be featured on the house were not always presented on the plans. Mr. Corsi was asked to return to the Commission for final approval of his plans. Features to be clarified included: double hung windows shown on the plans, not casements; rear roof to be extended over the new garage, with a new standing seam roof. Railings to be shown on the drawings where they will be repaired or replaced if necessary; and that the rear addition would fill in the U-shaped opening at the rear of the building, keeping the front of the building looking the same as it does. The Commission also asked for materials on the revised plans. There were no abutter comments.

93-95 Athelstane Road

Mr. Ginsberg, the current owner, presented his plans to demolish the house with his proposed buyer, Andrea Forsythe. Both attendees presented their belief that the house was too deteriorated to repair, and that the new owner wanted to

build a new two-family house. They also said the lot for this house was too awkward on which to construct additions, and abutters they spoke to were in support of a new house at this location.

Staff reported that this two-family house was built in 1927 in the Craftsman Style with an address of 95 Athelstane. A one-story garage was built the same year at the rear of the lot. The owner at that time was D. Hagan of 95 Athelstane Road. By 1938 the owner was Roger Tinkham, a salesman. During the War, the owners were Henry Bergson, a manager, and William Myette, who worked in wool. By 1953 the owners were Edward Ginsberg and Harry Yaffe, both of whom continued to reside there until at least the 1970s. Yaffe was listed as the single owner of record in 1975. This house is typical of the two-family style of dwellings constructed in this neighborhood in the late 1920s, with very little tear-down activity present. The presence of the original craftsman-esque corbeling at the eves, the pedimented portico, and massing and scale of the building are consistent tenets of 1920s Colonial Revival architecture found on this street. Staff therefore recommended this house preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members commented that they liked this house, and that the neighborhood had seen very little new development. Others believed the historic context in this neighborhood to be intact. The prospective owner of the house said she thought 37 Athelstane was a new house and that there were better maintained examples of this house style than this one.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 93-95 Athelstane preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Grissom seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 93-95 Athelstane Road preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

94 Harwich Road

Carmine Petruziello, owner of this house, distributed a map of the street showing all of the houses that have been altered or torn down in the neighborhood. Thirty eight total in the last ten years, he said. He also argued that this house was not worth saving. There were no abutter comments.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1960, and that this classic split-level house was constructed in a neighborhood of similarly designed homes by Creative Builders, Inc. and designed by Ralph Williams. Williams designed dozens of houses that were subsequently surveyed in Newton. This house is not one of them, though it does match other intact split-level housing developments found in the Oak Hill section of Newton, for example, and is located in a similarly intact neighborhood here. An early owner of record was Jerome O. Klein, a physician at Boston City Hospital and for whom an award is named at the BU School of Medicine. By 1970, another doctor named Steven Ablow owned the home; and by 1975, a third doctor, Sheldon Roth, owned the house. In 1976, a salesman named Alan Yaffe and his wife Harriet purchased the home. For historical context, staff recommended this house preferably preserved.

Commission members agreed with the owner.

Templer made a motion to find the house at 94 Harwich Road not preferably preserved. Armstrong seconded the motion.

Abstained

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 94 Harwich Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Dave Morton, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

207 Varick Road

Armando Petruzziello, owner of this house, and Mike McKay, architect, presented their plan to replace the house at this address. The gambrel-roofed house was found preferably preserved at the April 2014 hearing. At that hearing, Commission members found the house to be small but that the neighborhood retained its massing, scale, and small lots and thought the house should be preserved for neighborhood context.

McKay presented a plan for the new house that he said was close to the same height as the existing house, and had no attic. The garage was the only real addition, he said. The proposed roofline was also similar to existing, with simple windows, cedar shingles, rakes, clad-wood windows in a 2/2 profile, at about 3300 square feet. A real masonry chimney was also proposed.

Commission members expressed support for the design and its proposed scale in keeping with that of the neighborhood. Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road agreed.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to grant a waiver of the demo delay. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 207 Varick Road based on approved plans as presented.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

1453 Centre Street

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Armano Petruzziello, and his architect Mike McKay, presented their plans for a replacement house at this address. This house was found preferably preserved at the February 2014 hearing. At that hearing, Joanne Baker of 1445 Centre Street spoke to the beauty of the windows and the historic neighborhood. She told the Commission that abutters who

lived all around the property were represented here at the meeting. The owners at 1457 Centre Street told the Commission they had lived in the house since 1976 near the site of the Old Baptist Church, and that City Hall was across the street. This was old Newton they said, and it would be a shame to lose it. Abutters from 1461 Centre Street and Old Rogers Road were also in attendance to support saving the house.

At this hearing, Jeff Miller, an abutter, told the Commission that the owner and architect worked closely with the immediate neighborhood to address their concerns and that he was in support of the project as it was currently configured. He said he was still working with the owner on keeping trees on the property.

Though the Commission generally approved of the direction of the proposed plans, there were changes to some architectural elements that the Commission wanted to see made. These are: establish a jog in the wall at the kitchen side of the house (north side); add windows to the kitchen wall; line up first story windows on the north façade with the clerestory windows above; make a drafting improvement to the rear roof to break up the facades 12" on each side. Abutters also asked that the front door treatment, including the original Bullseye window blocks, be reused in the new house.

Grissom made a motion to grant a waiver of the demo delay on 1453 Centre Street with conditions. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 25, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 1453 Centre Street with the following conditions: establish a jog in the wall at the kitchen side of the house (north side); add windows to the kitchen wall; line up first story windows on the north façade with the clerestory windows above; make a drafting improvement to the rear roof to break up the facades 12" on each side. Abutters also asked that the front door treatment, including the original Bullseye window blocks, be reused in the new house.

ancy Grissom, Member
ff Templer, Member
ark Armstrong, Member
eter Dimond, Member
ura Fitzmaurice, Member
len Klapper, Alternate
dministrative:
linutes from the November 13th hearing were approved by a majority of the attendees at the hearing by 5-0.
ne meeting was adjourned at 9:45 pm.
aty Hax Holmes
ommission Staff

Voting in the Negative

Voting in the Affirmative:

Dave Morton, Chairman